

**Citizenship: Voting,  
Representation, and Parties**  
*University of Notre Dame*  
PHIL 20451 01-03  
Fall 2019

**Professor:** Dr. Graham Clay

**Email:** gclay@nd.edu

**Office Location:** 1st Floor Alcove in Malloy Hall (across from elevator)

**Office Hours:** Tu 12:15-1:15, W 1-2, and by appointment

**Class Location:** DeBartolo Hall 303

**Class Hours:** TuTh 11-12:15

**Course Description:**

This class is dedicated to helping you develop your views on some of the ethical issues related to citizenship in sovereign/territorial states. Our focus will be on representative democracies like the United States, but many of the issues we will analyze and discuss have broad application. We will have five debates, each focused on one of the following questions:

1. Should citizens vote?
2. Should it be relatively easy to become a citizen?
3. Are political parties good?
4. Which voting procedure should representative democracies deploy in their legislatures?
5. Should only public funds be used for political campaigns?

Much of the class will be dedicated to exploring different answers to these questions. Since many great philosophers of the past give persuasive answers to these questions, and our current thinking is indebted to them in many ways, we will spend some of our time studying their views. For instance, we will consider the views of James Madison on the influence of political parties. Nonetheless, our focus will not be on history for its own sake.

**Course Goals:**

By the end of this course, you should expect to have:

- Improved your ability to evaluate philosophical arguments and positions
- Begun to develop/refine your views on issues related to citizenship
- Improved your ability to read philosophical texts, including historical texts
- Improved your philosophical writing abilities
- Improved your oral debating abilities
- Learned about the positions of some historical philosophers

## **Grading:**

### 40%+ - Participation

#### 5% - Verbal Contributions During Class

Philosophy is a contact sport. This class is training for a life of doing philosophy, so you must engage with me and your classmates during lectures by asking questions, offering arguments, and responding to others' claims. If you ask a question or make a comment at least once per class (or so), you will get a perfect score.

#### 10% - Tuesday Quizzes

Until the Tuesday before Thanksgiving, there will be a short quiz at the start of every Tuesday class session. These quizzes are designed to be straightforward checks of your reading comprehension. Your two lowest scores will be dropped and there will be a curve.

#### 15% - Debate Contributions

There will be a total of five Thursday debates in class. In advance of each debate, I will divide the class into three groups, one for each side of the issue under discussion and one composed of judges. You will be randomly assigned to one of the three groups for each debate, although everyone will get a chance to be a judge. Two members of each of the non-judge groups will be randomly assigned to deliver their side's opening statement or their side's opening rebuttal, although everyone will get a chance to do one or the other, and some will get a chance to do both. After a debate has finished, the judges will vote to decide who wins. The majority will elect one of its members to deliver its reasons and the dissenting minority will do the same. These debates are opportunities for you to practice defending a philosophical position, regardless of whether it is yours or not. The quality and quantity of your contributions will be the source of your grade. If you are prepared, do your assigned job well, participate throughout, and make an earnest attempt to further the debate every time you speak, you will get a perfect score. More information about the debates will be provided prior to each of them.

#### 10% - Public Debate Assignments

In the evening of December 5th, our class will be hosting a public debate between Dr. Jason Brennan and Dr. Christopher Wellman on the subjects of immigration and citizenship. In class on December 3rd and 5th, we will be preparing for their debate by studying their positions by practicing defending/attacking them. You will be assigned a role and an assignment in this process of preparation. More information about these assignments will be provided closer to the date.

#### 3% - Extra Credit

If you attend the public debate in the evening of December 5th, you will earn extra credit for doing so.

20% - Mid-Term Essay10% - First Part - Due September 26th at 5PM via email

The first part of your mid-term essay is due via email to me relatively early in the semester. Your essay must be 3 pages or less (double spaced, 12pt Times New Roman, 1 inch margins). In it, you must articulate, argue for, and defend a position on the ethics of voting. This defense must involve the presentation of one serious objection to your view (many relevant objections will be discussed in class), as well as your response to this objection. More information about this essay assignment will be provided in class.

10% - Final Draft - Due October 17th at 5PM via email

Before the mid-term break, the complete version of your mid-term essay must be turned in via email to me. It must be 5 pages or less (double spaced, 12pt Times New Roman, 1 inch margins). In this essay, you must stick to the same position on the ethics of voting that you defended before. You should improve your argumentation and clean up your writing based on the feedback I give you on the first part, but you cannot substantially alter your previously expressed view. Then, you must support your position on the ethics of voting with a position on the nature of citizenship. You must defend your position on citizenship against one serious objection. The goal is to stake out a pair of views that are mutually reinforcing and defensible.

40% - Final Essay5% - Rough Draft Presentation - Present either December 10th or 12th

Your final essay must concern two topics from the class other than the ethics of voting. It must be 5 pages or less (double spaced, 12pt Times New Roman, 1 inch margins). Start by formulating your position on citizenship and then apply it to two topics we have discussed in class. So, for instance, you could state your version of the republican model of citizenship and then argue for a position on immigration and a position on campaign finance. You must present a serious objection to each of the two positions you defend and attempt to show why they do not undermine your view (you do not need to defend your broader view on citizenship in this paper).

You will be assigned one of the two dates listed above to present the rough draft of your final essay at the end of the semester. This is simply a low stakes opportunity for you to get useful feedback from your classmates on your final essay. All you need to do is tell the class—in general terms—what positions you will take, how you will argue for them, and what objections you will consider. Then your classmates will ask you questions and give you feedback in order to help you improve your essay. More information about this essay assignment will be provided in class.

35% - Final Draft - Due December 20th at 12:30PM

You must bring your final draft to the classroom on this day and time, and hand it to me in paper form. Emailed copies will not be accepted.

**Grading Scale:**

$g \geq 93$	A	$80 > g \geq 77$	C+
$93 > g \geq 90$	A-	$77 > g \geq 73$	C
$90 > g \geq 87$	B+	$73 > g \geq 70$	C-
$87 > g \geq 83$	B	$70 > g \geq 60$	D
$83 > g \geq 80$	B-	$g < 60$	F

**Attendance:**

Attendance is required, but everyone gets one unexcused absence. Each unexcused absence after the first results in the deduction of a third of one's overall letter grade (e.g. if you have two unexcused absences and your final grade would have been an A had you always been present, it would move to an A- because of your second unexcused absence).

**Technology Policy:**

You are not allowed to use any screened device during class, whether it's a phone, a laptop, or something else. The purpose of this class is to begin to develop your ethical views on citizenship, and doing so requires active engagement with me and your peers. Screened devices divide your attention and create unnecessary distractions.

**Readings:**

All readings will be provided via Sakai. They will be labeled with the dates by which they need to be read.

**Honor Code:**

You must comply with Notre Dame's honor code at all times. You can read more about your responsibilities under the honor code here: [honorcode.nd.edu/the-honor-code/](http://honorcode.nd.edu/the-honor-code/). Academic integrity is a serious matter, and I will report any violations of the honor code. Ask me if you have any questions about the honor code.

**Accessibility:**

Students who have a disability, or who have questions about disability, should come and talk to me. Students can also contact the Office of Disability Services for a confidential discussion in the Sara Bea Learning Center for Students with Disabilities, or by phone at 574-631-7157. All information given to Disability Services is confidential and is shared only with your consent. We recommend that students who believe they may need an accommodation for this course contact Disability Services at their earliest opportunity. This is to ensure there is time to complete the process before accommodations are actually needed. Additional information about Disability Services and the process for requesting accommodations can be found at [sarabeadisabilityservices.nd.edu](http://sarabeadisabilityservices.nd.edu).

## Class Schedule:

Tuesday, August 27 -      *Introductions, Course Details*

### Unit 1: The Ethics of Voting

Thursday, August 29 -      *Voting as a moral obligation*

**Reading #1:** Excerpts from Meehl, P., (1977), "The Selfish Voter Paradox and the Thrown-Away Vote Argument."

Tuesday, September 3 -      *Voting as helping without making a difference*

**Reading #2:** Excerpts from Nefsky, J., (2017), "How you can help, without making a difference."

**Quiz #1**

Thursday, September 5 -      *Voting as a morally expressive act*

**Reading #3:** Excerpts from Brennan, G. & Lomasky, L., (1993), *Democracy and decision: The pure theory of electoral preference.*

Tuesday, September 10 -      *Can it be bad to vote?*

**Reading #4:** Excerpts from Brennan, J., (2009), "Polluting the Polls: When Citizens Should Not Vote."  
Excerpts from Brennan, J., (2016), *Against Democracy.*

**Quiz #2**

Thursday, September 12 -      *Debate*

**Debate #1:    Should citizens vote?**

### Unit 2: The Nature and Conditions of Citizenship

Tuesday, September 17 -      *The republican model of citizenship*

**Reading #5:** Excerpts from Rousseau, J.J., (1761), *The Social Contract.*

**Quiz #3**

Thursday, September 19 -      *The liberal model of citizenship*

**Reading #6:** Excerpts from Locke, J., (1689), *Two Treatises on Government.*

Tuesday, September 24 -      *The feminist critique*

**Reading #7:** Excerpts from Okin, S.M., (1991), "Gender, the Public, and the Private."  
Excerpts from Young, I.M., (1990), *Justice and the Politics of Difference.*

**Quiz #4**

Thursday, September 26 -      *Justifying "open borders"*

**Reading #8:** Excerpts from Van Der Bossen, B. & Brennan, J., (2018), *In Defense of Openness.*

**First Part of Mid-Term Essay Due at 5PM via email**

Tuesday, October 1 -                      *Criticizing "open borders"*  
**Reading #9:** Excerpts from Altman, A. & Wellman, C.H., (2009), *A Liberal Theory of International Justice*.

**Quiz #5**

Thursday, October 3 -                      *Debate*  
**Debate #2:** **Should it be relatively easy to become a citizen?**

**Unit 3: Representation and Political Parties**

Tuesday, October 8 -                      *Representation and representatives*  
**Reading #10:** Excerpts from Pitkin, H.F., (1979), *The Concept of Representation*.  
 Excerpts from Mansbridge, J., (1999), "Should Blacks Represent Blacks and Women Represent Women?"  
 Excerpts from Guerrero, A.A., (2010), "The Paradox of Voting and the Ethics of Political Representation."

**Quiz #6**

Thursday, October 10 -                      *Should we have representatives at all?*  
**Reading #11:** Excerpts from Barber, B.R., (1984), *Strong Democracy*.

Tuesday, October 15 -                      *The causes and effects of political parties*  
**Reading #12:** Excerpts from Madison, J., (1787), *Federalist No. 10*.

**Quiz #7**

Thursday, October 17 -                      *Debate*  
**Debate #3:** **Are political parties good?**  
**Mid-Term Essay Due at 5PM via email**

Tuesday, October 22 -                      *Mid-Term Break (NO CLASS)*

Thursday, October 24 -                      *Mid-Term Break (NO CLASS)*

**Unit 4: Majority Rule and Voting Procedures**

Tuesday, October 29 -                      *Arguments for majority rule*  
**Reading #13:** Excerpts from Risse, M., (2004), "Arguing for Majority Rule."

**Quiz #8**

Thursday, October 31 -                      *An extreme response to the dangers of majority rule*  
**Reading #14:** Excerpts from United Nations Security Council bylaws.  
 Excerpts from Calhoun, J.C., (1851), *A Disquisition on Government*.

Tuesday, November 5 -                      *Evaluating different voting procedures*  
**Reading #15:** Excerpts from Pacuit, E., (2019), "Voting Methods."

**Quiz #9**

Thursday, November 7 - *Debate*

**Debate #4:** Which voting procedure should representative democracies deploy in their legislatures?

### **Unit 5: Political Campaigns and Campaign Finance**

Tuesday, November 12 - *Leveling the playing field*

**Reading #16:** Excerpts from Brighouse, H., (1995), "Political Equality and the Funding of Political Speech."

**Quiz #10**

Thursday, November 14 - *The free market solution*

**Reading #17:** Excerpts from Smith, B.A., (2019), "The Myth of Campaign Finance Reform."

Tuesday, November 19 - *The voucher solution*

**Reading #19:** Excerpts from Pevnick, R., (2019), "Should campaign finance reform aim to level the playing field?"

**Quiz #11**

Thursday, November 21 - *Debate*

**Debate #5:** Should only public funds be used for political campaigns?

Tuesday, November 26 - *Catch Up Day, Summary of the Semester, Essay Workshop*

Thursday, November 28 - *Thanksgiving Break (NO CLASS)*

Tuesday, December 3 - *Preparation for public debate*

**Reading #20:** Excerpts from Wellman, C.H. & Cole, P., (2011), *Debating the ethics of immigration*.  
Excerpts from Wellman, C.H., (2016), "Freedom of Movement and the Rights to Enter and Exit."

**Public Debate Assignment**

Thursday, December 5 - *Preparation for public debate*

**Reading #21:** Excerpts from Van Der Bossen, B. & Brennan, J., (2018), *In Defense of Openness*.

**Public Debate Assignment**

**Public Debate: Jason Brennan vs. Christopher Heath Wellman**

Tuesday, December 10 - *Student Presentations*

**Essay Workshop**

Thursday, December 12 - *Student Presentations*

**Essay Workshop**

Friday, December 20 - *Final Essays Due*

**Final Essay Due at 12:30PM in class**